
Equity Discussion Paper:

Should the New York City Department of Education Increase the Number of Screened High Schools for Outer-Borough Academically Strong Students



By David Rubel, Consultant

Copyright September 2015 all rights reserved

Summary

New York City has more than 400 high schools with over 700 individual programs that 8th grade students apply to. In school year 2014-15, around 77,000 students in the 8th grade, applied to one of these high schools. The purpose of this Discussion Paper is to shine a light on the NYC-DOE network of screened admissions high schools with the goal of generating discussion, further research and solutions. A methodology was created for the purpose of comparing the geographic distribution of top ranked screened schools to where academically strong students live. Academically strong students, for the purposes of the methodology, are defined as any student scoring a 3.0 or higher on the New York State English Language Arts (ELA) Exam. The analysis here focuses on the top 40 ranked NYC-DOE high schools (based on the DOE's own peer school system using 8th Grade ELA and Math test scores): 32 screened and the 8 SHSAT exam admissions based high schools. 10 highly competitive screened programs within hybrid high schools were also included in the grouping. Together, this group of 50 high schools has a total of 11,604 seat openings for 9th grade students.

Findings and Observations

- Using a ratio of seats available per qualified high school student, here is the borough breakdown:**

	7th Graders Scoring a 3 or 4 on ELA Test	% of total	Number of 9 th Grade Seats at Top Ranked High Schools	% of Total	Ratio of Students per Seats
Bronx	2157	11	840	7.2	For every one student there are .39 seats
Brooklyn	5957	31	3405	29.3	For every one student there are .57 seats
Manhattan	3059	16	4052	34.9	For every one student there are 1.3 seats
Queens	6445	34	2628	22.6	For every one student there are .40 seats
Staten Island	1346	7	679	5.8	For every one student there are .50 seats
Total	18964	99	11604	99.8	For every one student there are .61 seats

Source: New York City Department of Education. NYS ELA and Math Test scores for 2013-14. School Quality Guides 2013-14. Figures include both NYC-DOE students (17,941) and NYC Charter Schools (1,023 students). Private school students are not included in these figures.

For the top ranked high schools, on a student per seat ratio basis by borough, Manhattan has far more 9th grade seat openings than any of the other boroughs: three times as many as Queens, a little more than twice as many as Brooklyn, three times as many as the Bronx, and twice as many as Staten Island. The geographic distribution of screened high school seats for academically strong students is clearly not equitable (these figures do not include private school students applying for a high school seat).

- 2. Of the top ranked 50 NYC-DOE screened admissions high schools, not one is located in the Bronx.** This means that either an academically strong Bronx student scores well on the SHSAT exam (there are two SHSAT schools in the Bronx) or they have travel to another borough to attend a top ranked screened high school. In school year 2013-14, there were 2,157 students in the Bronx that meet the NYS-ELA 3 or 4 Test score for the entrance requirement for the top 50 screened high schools (another 2,124 Bronx students scored a 3 or 4 on the NYS-Math test). One Bronx high school, Bronx Center for Science and Mathematics, falls just outside the ranking. In 2014, it received 3,461 applications for 108 seats and should be given consideration as a top ranked high school opportunity for Bronx students. 17 top ranked screened (and audition based) high schools are located in Manhattan and none in the Bronx. This grouping of 50 screened high schools is based on ELA and Math 8th grade test score results found in the NYC-DOE Peer Index.

- 3. Citywide demand is greater than supply.** There is a significant mismatch between academically strong students and 9th grade openings in the top ranked high schools group. A total of 18,964 Seventh grade students (NYC-DOE and Charter Schools) scored a 3 or 4 on the NYS ELA test in 2014(a total of 21,732 seventh grade students scored a 3 or 4 on the Math Test). These students meet the ELA criteria (one of the three main criteria for admissions, the other two criteria are grades and the math test). However, there are only 7,618 screened seats along with the 3,986 SHSAT seats openings, for a total of 11,604 seats in these high schools. ***This means that around 7,360 students will not have a seat in one of these 50 high school programs.*** The actual number is even a bit higher since private school students are not included in the 18,964 figure. The big question is just how many of these 7,360 students end up in the group of 8th grade students not getting their first, second or third high school pick?

- 4. For school year 2014-15, there were 20,000 Round 2 high school seat offerings, however only 55 seats were available in the group of top ranked screened admissions schools for general education students.** Round 2 is the second part of the DOE High School Choice system. Round 2 is for two groups of students: students not matched to a high school; and students not happy with the match they got. The NYC-DOE distributes a Round 2 guide with all seats offerings still available. With the exception of the 50 top ranked screened high schools (includes 40 top ranked screened schools along 10 more hybrid schools with highly selective programs), most high schools have general education seats available. Many schools have 50 to 100 seats

still available. If an academically strong student isn't satisfied with their match, there isn't much they can do. Round 2 offerings are broken down into two groups: general education and students with disabilities. For the general education students, a total of only 55 seats were offered in the top ranked schools group.

5. Over the past 10 years, few new high school programs were created for academically strong students:

According to the NYC-DOE Citywide Council on High Schools 2012-13 Annual Report and other DOE sources, 244 new high school programs were created in the past 10 years. Of this group of new high schools, only six are in the 50 top ranked high schools/high school programs. By borough, two were launched in Manhattan, two in Queens, two in Brooklyn and none in the Bronx or Staten Island. While the current number of 7th grade students meeting the ELA Test entrance requirement for the screened schools is 26% of the total 7th grade student population, over the past 10 years, only 2.5% of new schools were in the 50 top ranked group. ***Here is the big question: when the NYC-DOE created 244 new high schools over the past 10 years, why weren't more screened schools for academically strong students also created.***

6. 59% of Manhattan screened high school 9th grade seats give admissions priority to Manhattan residents:

NYC-DOE High Schools are allowed to use geography as one of the eligibility factors for admitting students. A high school can restrict or prioritize admissions based on school district, borough, continuing 8th graders or feeder middle school. So for 59% of the Manhattan screened high school seats, outer-borough students will only get a shot at admissions after the school district (mainly school districts 2 and 3) or all Manhattan residents have been fully considered. ***Even if an outer-borough student is willing to commute, they will have a fair chance at gaining admission at only 41% of Manhattan screened seats.*** If you include both the three specialized high schools (Stuyvesant, HSMSE and LaGuardia) and screened high schools, then the number of Manhattan seats equally open to all NYC students is 60%.

7. The top ranked screened high schools should be part of the SHSAT admissions policy change public discussion:

While many more students attend the top ranked screened high schools (includes 32 individual high schools and 10 high competitive programs within a larger high school) than the eight SHSAT Exam schools (around 30,000 vs. 16,000 students), the public discussion has been narrowly focused on the SHSAT exam admissions based schools. The Mayor, UFT, City Council leadership and a coalition of civil rights and education advocacy organizations all want the SHSAT Exam only admissions policy abolished. Numerous op-eds, several studies and a law suit have not given much if any consideration to how the screened schools fit into the equity

equation. Changing the SHSAT exam is a zero sum game. For every student admitted under a new admissions policy, there is another student that will not be admitted even though they could get a passing score on the SHSAT exam. It's a bit like musical chairs. Throughout this SHSAT test controversy, a large group of academically strong students have sat on the sidelines without their issues being addressed. The Discussion Paper shows that there is a serious mismatch between the 18,964 seventh grade students that scored a 3.0 or higher on the ELA test and the fact that there are only 11,604 seats at high schools where the average ELA score is 3.0 or higher- a mismatch of 7,360 academically strong students. These students will be attending high schools where the average ELA test score is lower than the one they got. How many students in this group did not get their first, second or third high school choice? Also, within the group of 7,360 academically strong students, an estimated 3,500 are African American and Latino students. Where is the public voice for these students? ***Instead of abolishing the SHSAT exam admission system, a far better solution is to create more high school seats for academically strong students.***

8. **As classrooms adapt and succeed with the Common Core, it is highly likely that ELA and Math scores will also climb, increasing the pool of academically strong students.** The new Common Core based test caused a 38% drop in the number of 7th Grade students scoring a 3 or 4 on the ELA Test. The test scores used for the analysis in this Discussion Paper were from School Year 2013-14. However, these test scores are NYSED Common Core Learning Standards based. The last year before the new Common Core ELA and Math tests were used was for school year 2011-12. Across the City, the drop from school year 2011-12 to 2013-14 for 7th grade students taking the ELA test was 38%. As classrooms adapt and succeed with the Common Core, with students beginning a Common Core aligned curriculum as early as Pre-K, it is highly likely that ELA and Math scores will also climb. Therefore, the ratio of qualified students to available seats will also climb. As demand for top ranked screened schools increases, what will happen to the supply? Will the DOE create more screened schools for academically strong students?

Common Core Test Comparison by Borough and Year of 7th Grade ELA 3 or 4 Test Score

	School Year 2011-2012	School Year 2013-2014	Difference	Percent
Bronx	4,381	1956	-2425	-55%
Brooklyn	9005	5569	-3436	-38%
Manhattan	3693	2717	-976	-26%
Queens	9987	6392	-3595	-36%
Staten Island	2182	1307	-875	-40%
Total	29,248	17941	-11307	-38%

Source: NYC-Department of Education 2013-2014 NYC Results on the New York State 2013-2014 ELA Test

Recommendations:

- 1. DOE should thoroughly study its own high school admissions data to see the breakdown of students that are not getting their first, second or third choice. How many of these students fall into the academically strong group (based not just on ELA but also Math test scores and grades) and where do they live? The research would also show which areas of the City are most underserved?**
- 2. While the NYC-DOE has been making significant progress, it must devote more resources to creating new high schools for academically strong students in the outer boroughs (the actual number of new schools will depend on additional research discussed above). The formula for change and improvement is already well known, easily available and does not require more funding. Over the past 20 years, the NYC-DOE has a strong track record of creating excellent new high schools for academically strong students.**
- 3. Reframe the public debate regarding how best to help academically strong African American and Latino students. The debate should not confine itself only to the eight SHSAT exam based schools. The debate should also include the high school choice mismatch between academically strong students and the number of available seats for this group. Instead of a game of musical chairs, a better solution is to create more screened high school seats for academically strong students in geographically underserved areas of the City.**

I. Introduction:

In 2014, around 77,000 NYC 8th grade students applied for seats in NYC-DOE high schools. The purpose of this report is to shine a light on the unmet needs of one group of students that have not received much attention despite the SHSAT Exam controversy. After the 4,000 seats for the eight SHSAT schools are filled, there are another 15,000 academically strong students that must be matched to a high school that can offer them a solid and challenging education. This group of students scored a 3 or 4 on the NYS ELA Test. Many will want to seek admissions to one of NYC-DOE's screened admissions high schools (this Discussion Paper looks at the top ranked 32 screened admissions schools along with 10 highly competitive screened programs in hybrid high schools). Here is the NYC-DOE definition of a high school with a screened admissions policy:

Screened: Students who apply to Screened programs are ranked and selected based on criteria that may include: final report card grades from the prior school year, reading and math standardized test scores, and attendance and punctuality. There may be additional items that schools require to screen applicants such as an interview or essay. Review the Selection Criteria to determine what other criteria Screened schools use to rank applicants

What does it mean to be accepted to a screened school? It means that almost all of your classmates will have similar ELA and Math test scores and grades. In practical terms, this means that not only will a science or math class have students with similar test scores and grades, but all classes including English, social studies and foreign language. There is a big difference sitting in a classroom with kids who have similar academic achievement in contrast to another general education classrooms with a wide range of aptitude, achievement and motivation.

Discussion Paper Questions

- How important is it for each borough to have top ranked screened high schools in reasonably close proportion to the number of academically strong students? Do students living in the farther reaches of Queens, Brooklyn and the Bronx deserve a chance to attend a top school under an hour subway ride each way? How much is proximity a factor for families in selecting a high school.
- 19 out of the 50 high schools in this study (40 top ranked schools and 10 highly competitive programs that are part of a hybrid school) are located in Manhattan. For as long as there was a subway system, outer borough students have traveled on the subway for up to an hour each way to top schools in Manhattan. Is there anything wrong with this?
- In 2013, only 45% of students of 8th graders were matched to their first choice and 75% to their first, second or third choice (similar figures for 2014). The data in this Discussion Paper shows that there are 18,964 public school students that scored a 3 or 4 on the ELA test and only 11,604 seats in the 50 high school grouping. How many students in this group had to settle for their second, third or fourth pick, because there weren't any schools for academically strong students nearby? The actual number is a bit higher since private school students applying to a DOE high school are not included.

II. Methodology

The purpose of the methodology is encourage a serious discussion regarding the admissions challenges that confront academically strong 8th grade students in the NYC-DOE high school admissions selection system. There are two equity concerns that the methodology must address: 1) the geographic accessibility of top ranked schools to academically strong students and 2) the issue of citywide supply of strong academic high schools and demand for these schools. To make comparisons between boroughs, the methodology has to define and explain two groups: **qualified students** and **screened and/or top ranked high schools**. The methodology used here is based on readily available data sources found on the NYC-DOE website.

- 1. Qualified students:** The first group is comprised of qualified students. To make a comparison, an objective and accurate definition of what constitutes a qualified student is required. The definition of qualified (or academically strong) student is defined as any 7th grade student who scored a 3 or 4 on the NYS ELA test. Screened schools mostly used three admissions criteria: a score of 3 or 4 on the ELA and Math test; an average of 85 or higher in ELA, Math, Science and Social Studies; and good attendance. For this Discussion Paper, the ELA scores were chosen over the Math scores. In academically challenging schools, most courses such as ELA, Social Studies and Science require strong reading comprehension and writing skills. Math is obviously also important. Student math scores are always higher than ELA scores. 7th grade test scores were chosen since that is the testing year high schools use for admitting students. The DOE provides this information in many formats including an annual excel [spreadsheet](#).

2013-2014 NYS Test Scores for NYC-DOE 7 th Graders	Bronx	Brooklyn	Queens	Manhattan	Staten Island	Total
NYS ELA	1956	5569	6392	2717	1307	17941
NYS Math	2124	5965	7675	2894	1481	20139

Source: NYC-Department of Education 2013-2014 NYC Results on the New York State 2013-2014 ELA and Math Tests.

2013-2014 NYS Test Scores for NYC-Charter Schools 7 th Graders	Bronx	Brooklyn	Queens	Manhattan	Staten Island	Total
NYS ELA	201	388	53	342	39	1023
NYS Math	269	680	60	513	53	1575

Source: NYC-Department of Education 2013-2014 NYC Results on the New York State 2013-2014 ELA and Math Tests.

Methodology limitations: The available DOE data only shows the number of students scoring a 3 or 4 on the ELA test or the number of students scoring a 3 or 4 on the Math test. It does not show the number of students scoring a 3 or 4 on **both** the NYS Math and ELA exams. In other words, there are data on the number of student test scores for ELA and another set of test scores for Math.

While this Report uses the ELA test as the indicator of a student's qualification to succeed at a screened high school. The other main admissions criteria are student grades and attendance. Reliable grade information showing how many students meet this criteria by school or borough is not

available. Since only one test score is available for a student, it is possible that a student had a score of 3 on the ELA test and a 2 on the Math Test. However, this is a Discussion Paper. It's more about asking questions than, due to the limits of available public data, providing final answers. *Grades are certainly a much more important indicator of present and future academic achievement than test scores.* The DOE has access to a fuller range of data including how many students score a 3 or 4 on both tests and student GPA in math, ELA, science and social studies. An analysis using ELA and Math test scores and grades should be undertaken by the DOE.

Private school students are not included in the Discussion Paper: Private school students also apply and end up switching over to a NYC-DOE high school. While an important group, the number is not easily available through public sources. Also, there is no data kept on the ELA and Math test scores for this group of students applying to NYC-DOE high schools. According to NYU High School Admissions 2015 study, [*Pathways to an Elite Education: Application, Admission, and Matriculation to New York City's Specialized High Schools Working Paper*](#). March 2015 by Sean Cochran and Christine Baker-Smith, about 9.5% of the 8th grade students applying to a NYC-DOE high school are from private schools. Also, there isn't available data on actual grades and test scores of private school students applying to NYC-DOE high schools.

2. Schools: Two separate comparisons were made. The first comparison just looked at the top 50 high schools based on a NYC-DOE peer ranking of 40 schools plus 10 highly competitive hybrid school programs (see appendix for most current NYC-DOE peer ranking chart of the top 40 high schools). This group includes both the 8 SHSAT exam schools and 32 screened schools (a few schools also require a talent audition). The screened schools high schools require a 3 or 4 test score AND 85 or above grade average in Math, English, Science and Social Studies. The ranking used here has absolutely no value except for the purposes of constructing a methodology to determine how much geographic equity there is. Despite having the same admissions criteria, some screened schools rank much higher than others. A second comparison of just screened schools with basically the same admissions policy can be found in the appendix beginning on page 18.

- **40 top ranked high schools:** The NYC-DOE School Peer Grouping was used to identify the top ranked 40 High Schools in New York City. The Peer Grouping is based on 8th Grade ELA and Math Scores. This grouping (which can easily be converted into a ranking) includes both the 8 SHSAT Schools and the Top 32 Screened Schools (which also includes audition based La Guardia High School). In the Appendix, the NYC-DOE Peer Grouping for the top 31 schools was cut and pasted from the DOE website. The remaining 9 schools were added in ranking order based only on their ELA score. The official NYC DOE Peer Group for the top ranked 31 schools can be seen in the Appendix.
- **10 Hybrid model high schools:** Another 10 schools included in the top ranking group belong to the hybrid model high school. These are high schools across the City that have several different programs catering to different groups of students. These high schools are big with 3,000 to 4,000 students each. They have a neighborhood zone admissions policy along with one or more special programs based on a very selective policy of test scores, grades and attendance (some have writing samples too). Because these schools aggregate

their student data in the official NYC-DOE and NYSED annual reports, based on the total number of students, their ranking in the Peer Group Index will not reflect just one group of students or another. For example, Francis Lewis high school has a total of 4,058 students; around 350 seats are available for academically strong students are in four separate screened programs and another 650 seats are admitted by zone. The methodology here includes the following school programs as one composite school for the hybrid schools in Queens (Bayside, Cardozo, Francis Lewis, Forest Hills), Brooklyn (Fort Hamilton, Madison and New Utrecht) and the Staten Island (Susan Wagner, Tottenville, New Dorp). These screened programs have the same admissions criteria of a 3 or 4 test score, 85 or higher GPA for English, math, science and social studies and attendance. The rationale for doing is this is because these programs are well known and recognized for being highly selective and attracting academically strong students. The group of hybrid schools programs are highly competitive for admissions (1 seat for every 15 or more applicants for all of the schools except Staten Island; some of these schools have only one seat for every 20 or even 30 applicants). Since they are hybrid schools, there is no data available on test scores by individual school program within the high school. The same problem applies to the Ed. Opt programs that are at the hybrid schools. These schools are not the same as single program screened school. The hybrid schools may offer a math and science track to the screened students but other classes including English and social studies may be mixed with all students. These hybrid screened programs must be included in a citywide analysis because they offer students in Brooklyn, Queens and Staten Island a comparable education environment as the 40 top ranked schools.

- **Screened high schools:** 62 screened high schools in NYC all have an entrance criteria that includes scoring a 3 or 4 on the NYS ELA and Math Test and GPA of at least an 80 or higher for ELA, Math, Social Studies and Science (most have 85 and a few have 90). Of these 62 screened high school, there is actually a wide range of ELA and Math test scores according to the NYC-DOE peer group data. The ranking scores range from a very high three or a very low three. By including both groups of schools, the reader will have a much better understanding of the available resources. To see actual individual school scores in the NYC-DOE Peer grouping, go to the appendix.

- **Education Option (Ed. Opt):** there is another important group of NYC-DOE high schools known as Ed. opt. None of the Ed. Opt schools were in the NYC-DOE top 40 peer school ranking. It is possible that there are Ed. Opt programs at the Hybrid schools that would make a high ranking but there isn't any data available to show this. There are two high schools with Ed. Opt. programs that are highly competitive: Francis Lewis and Forest Hills. These two programs are included in the top schools ranking. Here is the NYC-DOE official definition of an Ed. Opt school.

Educational Option (Ed. Opt.)

Educational Option programs are meant to serve a wide range of academic performers. Based on English Language Arts (ELA) standardized test scores from the prior school year, students will be matched to Ed. Opt. programs based on the following distribution: **16%** from the high reading level; **68%** from the middle reading level; and **16%** from the low reading level. Half of the students matched to Ed. Opt. programs will be selected based on their rankings from the school. The other half will be selected randomly.

- 3. Other top school ranking criteria that could be used in this methodology:** The most important part of the methodology is how schools were selected for the ranking. The NYC-DOE Peer Index was used to select the schools for the ranking (it can be found on page 17 of the 2013-14 School Quality Guide for each high school). For the high schools, the Peer Index is based on 8th grade reading and math scores. This is an imperfect criteria for selecting schools. The DOE provides this information in many formats including an annual excel [spreadsheet](#). 38 of the 40 schools have a 3.00 or higher as the average of ELA test score for incoming students. The cut off is open to discussion. There are another 30 schools that have test scores very close to the cut off number for 40. There are other criteria such as the SAT, NYS Regents or Advanced Placement Test Scores could also have been used to group the top ranked schools. All three sets of data are available on the NYC-DOE website and broken down by high school. Each one offers a different objective ranking of student achievement. While the criteria would change, the underlying rationale for the methodology would stay the same. NYC-DOE High schools can be ranked and compared using objective data. The ranking will allow for an analysis of how equitable is the geographic distribution of schools across the five boroughs.
- 4. Highly competitive schools outside the top school ranking:** One of the purposes of the Discussion Paper is to shine a light on the issue of supply and demand for 9th grade seats for academically strong students. There are numerous well regarded high schools with very competitive admissions that fall below the group of 50 schools ranking. These schools are Ed. Opt, limited unscreened and screened. Competitive admissions is defined as a school with at least 10 applicants for every 1 seat. Here is a breakdown by borough of this group of schools. The numbers below reinforce the distribution found in the top 50 school ranking.

Borough	Schools	Number of Seats	Percent of Seats
Bronx	16	1592	22.5
Brooklyn	12	1316	18.6
Manhattan	21	2,581	36.6
Queens	10	1,391	19.7
Staten Island	2	169	2.3
Total	62	7,049	99.7

Source: New York City High School Directory 2014-15 School Year

III. Documentation of Data and Analysis: What the NYC-DOE data shows us about the geographic match (or mismatch) between academically strong students and top-ranked high schools:

“Sometimes kids fixate on a school in another borough, get in, but drop out because the commute is impractical,” offers Clara Hemphill. “We created a video that shows kids what they would be getting into.” Source: New York Community Trust Grants Newsletter June 2013

The main question that is explored in this Discussion Paper is to what extent are the top ranked high schools in geographic proximity to the students that meet basic qualifications for admissions. There is a full description with statistics and parent comments for every screened school on the [Inside Schools](#) website. However, a major premise of the DP is that the screened high schools, as a distinct group within the NYC-DOE high school system, do not get the attention they deserve. While the SHSAT schools have been widely reported in the media, the screened schools actually educate many more students. There are 3,986 openings for the eight SHSAT schools and 7,618 openings for the top 32 screened (and audition) schools and 10 highly competitive programs in hybrid high schools. In this section, these two groups, broken down by borough, are presented to shed light on this group of screened schools. Finally, there is the question of citywide demand and supply. Right now, due to the paucity of publicly available data, it is impossible to tell how many students that fall into the group that didn’t get their first, second or third high school choice and were seeking admissions to a top high school. If this data was public, then the gap where the greatest need for new schools are could be pinpointed.

A. Top NYC-DOE High Schools Based on the NYC-DOE Peer Group Index

(8 SHSAT Exam Schools, 32 Screened Schools and 10 highly competitive programs within large high schools)

This group includes both the 8 SHSAT schools, 32 screened high schools and 10 high competitive programs within large hybrid schools, for a total of 50 schools/programs. Within the top schools there are two types of schools: screened and SHSAT test based school. There is also a third group of schools that was thoroughly discussed in the methodology section: 10 highly competitive individual programs within a hybrid school in Brooklyn, Queens or Staten Island. The NYC-DOE has its own publicly available internal ranking system known as peer schools. A peer school means a group of schools with the closest ELA and Math scores. The peer school system allows one to see the 30 to 40 schools that can be easily ranked according to the test scores for making comparisons. Here is the NYC-DOE definition:

“Each school's performance is compared to the performance of schools in its peer group. Peer schools are those New York City public schools with a student population most like this school's population, according to the peering characteristics. Each school has up to 40 peer schools (except for K-8 schools, which have up to 30 peer schools).

Peer groupings are created using a matching methodology that examines the mathematical difference between a school and all potential peers on the peering characteristics. Schools with the smallest difference across all the characteristics are peered together.” Source: NYC-DOE School Quality Review.

Seven of the findings and observations presented in the beginning of the Discussion Paper are based on an analysis of the data in this chart.

Top Ranked 50 NYC-DOE High Schools

	High School	Borough	9 th Grade Openings	7 th Grade Students Scoring 3 or 4 on NYS ELA (2013-14)
1	Bard High School Early College	Manhattan	150	
2	Baruch College Campus High School	Manhattan	111	
3	Beacon High School	Manhattan	310	
4	Columbia Secondary School	Manhattan	96	
5	Eleanor Roosevelt High School	Manhattan	125	
6	Fiorello H. LaGuardia High School of Music & Art and Performing Arts	Manhattan	696	
7	High School for Mathematics, Science and Engineering at City	Manhattan	110	
8	Manhattan / Hunter Science High School	Manhattan	108	
9	Manhattan Center for Science and Mathematics	Manhattan	412	
10	Millennium High School	Manhattan	180	
11	N.Y.C. Lab School for Collaborative Studies	Manhattan	136	
12	N.Y.C. Museum School	Manhattan	124	
13	New Explorations into Science, Technology and Math	Manhattan	160	
14	NYC I School	Manhattan	118	
15	Professional Performing Arts High School	Manhattan	102	
16	School of the Future	Manhattan	108	
17	Special Music School	Manhattan	50	
18	Stuyvesant High School	Manhattan	814	
19	Talented Unlimited	Manhattan	142	
	Total		4052	3059
20	Bronx High School of Science	Bronx	750	
21	High School of American Studies at Lehman College	Bronx	90	
	Total		840	
22	Benjamin Banneker Academy	Brooklyn	240	
23	Brooklyn College Academy	Brooklyn	140	
24	Brooklyn Latin School, The	Brooklyn	150	
25	Brooklyn Technical High School	Brooklyn	1300	
26	Leon M. Goldstein High School for the Sciences	Brooklyn	275	
27	Medgar Evers College Preparatory School	Brooklyn	233	
28	Midwood High School	Brooklyn	550	
29	Millennium Brooklyn HS	Brooklyn	135	
30-32	Brooklyn Hybrid Schools: Fort Hamilton, James Madison, New Utrecht.	Brooklyn	382	
	Total		3405	

	High School	Borough	9 th Grade Openings	7 th Grade Students Scoring 3 or 4 on NYS ELA (2013)	
33	Academy of American Studies	Queens	102		
34	Baccalaureate School for Global Education	Queens	81		
35	Bard High School Early College Queens	Queens	160		
36	Frank Sinatra School of the Arts High School	Queens	198		
37	Queens Gateway to Health Sciences Secondary School	Queens	108		
38	Queens High School for the Sciences at York College	Queens	104		
39	Queens School of Inquiry	Queens	81		
40	Scholars' Academy	Queens	108		
41	Townsend Harris High School	Queens	270		
42	York Early College	Queens	81		
43-46	Queens Hybrid High Schools: Cardozo, Francis Lewis, Forest Hills, Bayside,	Queens	1335		
	Total		2628		6445
47.	Staten Island Technical High School	SI	300		
48-50	Staten Island Hybrid schools: New Dorp, Susan Wagner and Tottenville	SI	379		
	Total		679	1346	

Notes: Students scoring a 3 or 4 include both District and Charter School students. The 40 numbered schools were ranked based on the NYC-DOE Peer system. 10 programs in hybrid schools in Queens, Brooklyn and Staten Island were included since admissions for these programs is highly competitive (1 seat for every 15 or more applicants for all of the schools except Staten Island). Since they are Hybrid schools, there is no data available on test scores by individual school program within the high school. The same problem applies to the Ed. Opt programs that are at the Hybrid schools. LaGuardia High School, Professional Performing Arts, Special Music School, Talent Unlimited and Frank Sinatra all require an audition in addition to test scores and grades. Midwood is a hybrid school and its test scores include all honors and zoned students. School of the Future is a limited screen school and does not use test scores to admit students.

B. The NYC-DOE High School match data for 2014 and 2015 shows that the competition for the top ranked screened schools is the fiercest among all NYC high schools (excluding the SHSAT Exam schools)

In 2014 and 2015, around 25% of 8th grade students did not get their first, second or third choice high school choice. "Some 45% of the 77,043 students who applied in December got into their No. 1 pick, according to the New York City Department of Education. Nearly three-quarters got into one of their top three schools." NY Daily News March 11, 2014. The question is how many academically strong students fall into the group of 4th pick or worse because of a lack of screened schools. Below are two charts. The first chart shows the number of seats available vs. the number of applicants. This chart clearly shows that there is very fierce competition for the top ranked screened schools.

Applicants vs. Seats Available at most competitive schools for 2013-14 School Year

School Name	Program Name	Selection Method	Grade	2014 Applicants	9th Grade Seats Available
Baruch College Campus High School	Baruch College	Screened	9	7,238	111
Eleanor Roosevelt High School	Eleanor Roosevelt High School	Screened	9	5,740	125
Beacon High School	The Beacon School	Screened	9	5,596	310
Townsend Harris High School	Intensive Academic Humanities	Screened	9	5,521	270
Millennium High School	Millennium High School	Screened	9	5,500	180
Leon M. Goldstein High School	Leon M. Goldstein High School	Screened	9	5,170	275
Francis Lewis High School	Jacob K. Javits Law Institute	Ed Opt	9	4,685	100
Manhattan/Hunter Science High School	Manhattan/Hunter Science High School	Screened	9	4,656	108
Francis Lewis High School	Math and Science Research	Screened	9	4,600	75
Forest Hills High School	Law & Humanities Institute	Ed Opt	9	4,551	136
Midwood High School	Medical Science Institute	Screened	9	4,464	338
Midwood High School	Humanities Institute	Screened	9	4,437	212
Forest Hills High School	Carl Sagan Science/Math Honors Academy	Screened	9	4,118	204
NYC Lab School for Collaborative Studies	College Prep	Screened	9	3,624	136
Total					2580

Source: www.insideschools.org and NYC Department of Education

NYC-DOE Round 2 data shows that top ranked high schools are already fully matched while most high schools still have openings: Besides the number of applicants vs number of seats data, the only other data available on need, demand and supply is what is known as the **Round 2 option**. After the first high school match is completed and students get their notification of a match, **Round 2** is for the 8,000 to 9,000 students that received no seat, or some of the 16,000 students that fall into the fourth or lower choice group (these are students that did not get their first, second or third choice of high schools). Together there are at least 25,000 students or nearly 1/3 of the total number of 8th grade NYC-DOE students that may be seeking seats for Round 2.

The nine page **DOE Round 2** guide list hundreds of schools with the number of seats still available (the NYC-DOE has language that says “offers listed below are approximate”). The total number of openings is 20,305 for general education students (there is a separate column for special education students). The 20,305 does not include the number of openings from the zoned schools. So the total number of available seats for Round 2 is even larger. To be eligible for **Round 2**, a student must go their middle school counselor and select a new school. The student will automatically lose the other school they were matched to in the first round.

If a academically strong student did not get into their choice of one of the top ranked 50 screened high schools, they will have to comb the nine pages of the **Round 2** list looking for another seat. ***Out of the 20,000 plus seats available, only 55 seats are in the 50 top ranked screened schools.***

	2015 Round 2: General Education Openings	2015 Round 2: Top 50 Screened Schools General Education Openings
Bronx	4335	0
Brooklyn	9015	15
Manhattan	3300	10
Queens	3095	30
Staten Island	560	0
Total	20305	55

Source: approximate openings found on 2015 NYC-DOE High School Admissions Round 2 Program List. The 20,305 openings does not include zoned schools.

While the DOE was creating 244 new high schools over the past 10 years, why wasn't there more attention given to where the need is greatest (and most likely demand) for more seats. It is clear from the chart above that when an academically strong student is not happy with their match or doesn't get a match, they will have to choose a school with students with lower test scores. ***With the exception of 55 seats, there is no Round 2 for this group of students.*** Only the NYC-DOE knows how many students are affected by this mismatch between supply and demand. If the Mayor, City Council, United Federation of Teachers (UFT) and public policy organizations are going to help fix the NYC-DOE high school admission system for academically strong African American and Latino students, here is a great place to start.

C. The top ranked screened high schools should be part of the SHSAT admissions policy change public discussion

While many more students attend the top ranked screened high schools (includes 32 individual high schools and 10 high competitive programs within a larger high school) than the 8 SHSAT Exam schools (around 30,000 vs. 16,000 students), the public discussion has been narrowly focused on the eight SHSAT exam admissions based schools. The Mayor, UFT, City Council leadership and a coalition of civil rights and education advocacy organizations all want the SHSAT Exam only admissions policy abolished. Numerous op-eds, several studies and a law suit have not given much if any consideration to how the screened schools fit into the equity equation for academically strong students. Despite the heavy hitter line up for abolishing the SHSAT Exam only admissions policy, the research shows that the result may have unintended consequences. A 2015 study by Sean Corcoran and Christine Baker-Smith at New York University showed that a change in admissions policy will most likely help Latino and female students, but do little for African American students.

“Offers based on state test scores, grades, and attendance would increase the share of Latino and White students in specialized high schools, and reduce the share of Asian students (who would remain significantly over-represented).

□ These rule changes would not appreciably increase the proportion of Black students admitted, and, alarmingly, several of these alternative criteria would actually decrease the number of Black students offered a specialized school seat. A simulated rule based on test scores and grades that also enforces proportional representation by borough would moderately increase the share of Black students.

□ All simulated admissions rules based on state test scores, grades, and attendance instead of the SHSAT would tip the gender balance in specialized high schools in favor of girls.”¹

What has been missing from the public discussion is the big mismatch between top ranked screened high school seats and academically strong students. With the exception of one essay ([In defense of New York City's selective high schools by Derrell Bradford, Feb. 2, 2015](#)), the role of screened schools has been overlooked.

Chart C-1.

	7th Graders Scoring a 3 or 4 on ELA Test	% of total	Number of 9 th Grade Seats at Top Ranked High Schools	% of Total	Ratio of Students per Seats
Total	18,964	99	11604	99.8	For every one student there are .61 seats

The chart above shows that there were 18,964 seventh grade students that scored at least a 3.0 on their NYS ELA exam. It also shows that since there were only 11,604 available ninth grade seats in schools where the average ELA score is 3.0 or higher, there is a very significant mismatch between supply and demand. ***What happens to the group of 7,360 academically strong students that won't be attending a high school where the average ELA score is 3.0 or higher? How many students in this group did not get their first, second or third high school choice? Changing the SHSAT Test admissions policy will not help them.***

Abolishing SHSAT exam admissions only policy means a zero sum game for 8th graders. For every student that will be admitted under a new admissions policy, there is another student that will not be admitted even though they could get a passing score on the SHSAT exam. It's a bit like musical chairs. Let's say 500 or 1,000 SHSAT High School seats are now allotted using a new criteria of grades, test scores, interviews and recommendations. To make room for these students, 500 to 1,000 students with test scores high enough to land them a seat under the existing system, will not be accepted? Most likely they will seek a seat in one of the top ranked screened schools.

- **Within the group of 7,300 academically strong students that won't be attending a high school where the average ELA score is 3.0 or higher, close to half of these students are African American or Latino:** One group of African American and Latino students may benefit from the SHSAT admissions policy change while a much larger number of academically strong African

¹ Pathways to an Elite Education: Exploring Strategies to Diversify NYC's Specialized High Schools by Sean Corcoran and Christine Baker-Smith. New York University March 2015.

American and Latino students, around 3,500 will see absolutely no benefit. The reason is because changing the SHSAT admissions policy will not add a single new seat for academically strong students. To arrive at this estimate of 3,500, a formula was constructed.

- **Formula for estimating the number of African American and Latino academically strong students without a match to a top ranked high school:** The NYC-DOE chart on page 19 shows that a total of 36,096 students attend the top ranked schools and 12,013 are either Black or Latino (grades 9 to 12). For the purpose of constructing a formula, let's divide the total enrollment by four years to arrive at a figure for 9th grade students. Now there are 9,024 seats in total and 3,003 seats filled by Black and Hispanic students (the remaining seats are filled by white, Asian or unknown). In 2013-14 school year, 7,559 NYC-DOE public school seventh grade Black and Hispanic students scored either a 3 or 4 on the NYS ELA exam (this figure does not include Charter Schools).
- **Hybrid high school programs must also be factored in:** Chart C-2 does not include the hybrid schools because DOE does not have publicly available data showing the ethnic breakdown for the selective programs at these high schools (only the total high school student figures). Since Chart C-2 does not include the hybrid schools, only an estimate of how many seats these schools offer broken down by ethnicity can be provided (this group includes Fort Hamilton, James Madison, New Utrecht, Midwood, Cardozo, Francis Lewis, Forest Hills, Bayside, New Dorp, Susan Wagner and Tottenville). There are 2,646 seats in selective programs at the hybrid high schools. Let's assume for the purpose of the formula that half of these seats are filled by African American and Latino and the other half with white or Asian students. Adding the two figures together (3,003 and 1,323), there would be a total of 4,326 seats filled by African American and Latino at the top ranked schools where the ELA average test score is 3.0 or higher (two schools in the chart below had an average of 2.9).

$$7,559 - 4,326 = 3,233$$

A total of 7,559 NYC-DOE schools African American and Latino seventh grade students scored at least 3.0 on the NYS ELA test (the group number is higher since it doesn't include Charter School students). So, at least 3,233 African American and Latino academically strong students would belong to the group that did not attend a school with a 3.0 average or higher (factoring in Charter School students would bring the figure up to 3,500 conservatively). Instead, they attended a high school where the average test score was lower than the one they actually achieved. While some of these students may have gotten into their first or second choice, and it wasn't a school where the average ELA test score was 3.0 or higher, clearly this is not the case for all 3,500. The needs of this group of African American and Latino students is not being addressed by the coalition that wants to abolish the SHSAT exam.

In summary, the group of 7,300 students that scored a 3 or 4 on the ELA exam, but will not be attending a high school where the average test score is at least a 3.0, will see no improvement whatsoever. Let's assume that half of these students choose a school as a first, second or third choice because it was "op-ed" or had a specialization (technology, arts, health) they liked, that would still leave 3,000 students attending a school where the ELA schoolwide average is lower than their ELA score. Changing the SHSAT admissions policy will not help this group of academically strong students. ***The reason is because there will not be any net growth in the number of seats for academically strong students.*** By changing the SHSAT exam admissions policy, one group of students will be offered more opportunity while another equally deserving and much larger group of students will see no improvement whatsoever.

Instead of abolishing the SHSAT exam admission system, a far better solution is to create more high school seats for academically strong students.

Appendix 1:

New York City Department of Education Peer Group System 2013-14

Each school's performance is compared to the performance of schools in its peer group. Peer schools are those New York City public schools with a student population most like this school's population, according to the peering characteristics. Each school has up to 40 peer schools (except for K-8 schools, which have up to 30 peer schools).

Peer groupings are created using a matching methodology that examines the mathematical difference between a school and all potential peers on the peering characteristics. Schools with the smallest difference across all the characteristics are peered together.” Source: NYC-DOE School Quality Review Page 17.

DBN	School	Average English Proficiency	Average Math Proficiency
02M475	Stuyvesant High School	3.99	4.14
01M539	New Explorations into Science, Technology and Math High School	3.48	3.49
01M696	Bard High School Early College	3.70	3.64
02M411	Baruch College Campus High School	3.23	3.24
02M412	N.Y.C. Lab School for Collaborative Studies	3.29	3.15
02M414	N.Y.C. Museum School	3.18	3.11
02M416	Eleanor Roosevelt High School	3.64	3.59
02M418	Millennium High School	3.35	3.16
03M479	Beacon High School	3.50	3.24
03M485	Fiorello H. LaGuardia High School of Music & Art and Perform	3.56	3.34
03M541	Manhattan / Hunter Science High School	3.17	3.17
04M435	Manhattan Center for Science and Mathematics	3.03	3.17
05M362	Columbia Secondary School	3.39	3.05
05M692	High School for Mathematics, Science and Engineering at City	3.67	3.75
10X445	Bronx High School of Science	3.84	3.95
10X696	High School of American Studies at Lehman College	3.78	3.71
13K430	Brooklyn Technical High School	3.69	3.86
14K449	Brooklyn Latin School, The	3.53	3.56
15K684	Millennium Brooklyn HS	3.26	2.98
17K590	Medgar Evers College Preparatory School	3.07	2.97
22K405	Midwood High School	3.06	3.05
22K535	Leon M. Goldstein High School for the Sciences	3.32	3.31
22K555	Brooklyn College Academy	3.13	2.89
24Q299	Bard High School Early College Queens	3.70	3.78
25Q525	Townsend Harris High School	3.99	4.05
27Q323	Scholars' Academy	3.66	3.44
28Q680	Queens Gateway to Health Sciences Secondary School	3.36	3.01
28Q687	Queens High School for the Sciences at York College	3.74	3.96
30Q501	Frank Sinatra School of the Arts High School	3.39	3.10
30Q580	Baccalaureate School for Global Education	3.68	3.47
31R605	Staten Island Technical High School	3.83	3.91
PEER GROUP AVERAGES		3.49	3.43

This chart is a cut and paste from the NYC-DOE School Quality Guide for Stuyvesant High School 2013-14

Appendix 2:

Chart Showing that None of the 50 Top Ranked Screened High Schools are located in the Bronx.

	DBN	School	Average English Proficiency	Average Math Proficiency
1	02M475	<u>Stuyvesant High School</u>	3.99	4.14
2	25Q525	Townsend Harris High School	3.99	4.05
3	10X445	Bronx High School of Science	3.84	3.95
4	31R605	Staten Island Technical High School	3.83	3.91
5	10X696	High School of American Studies at Lehman College	3.78	3.71
6	28Q687	Queens High School for the Sciences at York College	3.74	3.96
7	01M696	Bard High School Early College	3.70	3.64
8	24Q299	Bard High School Early College Queens	3.70	3.78
9	13K430	Brooklyn Technical High School	3.69	3.86
10	30Q580	Baccalaureate School for Global Education	3.68	3.47
11	05M692	High School for Mathematics, Science and Engineering at City	3.67	3.75
12	27Q323	Scholars' Academy	3.66	3.44
13	02M416	Eleanor Roosevelt High School	3.64	3.59
14	03M485	Fiorello H. LaGuardia High School of Music & Art and Perform	3.56	3.34
15	14K449	Brooklyn Latin School, The	3.53	3.56
16	03M479	Beacon High School	3.50	3.24
17	01M539	New Explorations into Science, Technology and Math High School	3.48	3.49
18	05M362	Columbia Secondary School	3.39	3.05
19	30Q501	Frank Sinatra School of the Arts High School	3.39	3.10
20	28Q680	Queens Gateway to Health Sciences Secondary School	3.36	3.01
21	02M418	Millennium High School	3.35	3.16
22	22K535	Leon M. Goldstein High School for the Sciences	3.32	3.31
23	02M412	N.Y.C. Lab School for Collaborative Studies	3.29	3.15
24	15K684	Millennium Brooklyn HS	3.26	2.98
25	02M411	Baruch College Campus High School	3.23	3.24
26	02M414	N.Y.C. Museum School	3.18	3.11
27	03M541	Manhattan / Hunter Science High School	3.17	3.17
28	22K555	Brooklyn College Academy	3.13	2.89
29	17K590	Medgar Evers College Preparatory School	3.07	2.97
30	22K405	Midwood High School	3.06	3.05
31	04M435	Manhattan Center for Science and Mathematics	3.03	3.17
32	M	NYC I School	3.08	2.81
33	B	Benjamin Banneker	3.08	2.82
34	M	Professional Performing Arts High School	3.15	2.77
35	M	Special Music School	3.07	2.91
36	M	School of the Future	3.03	2.72
37	Q	Queens School of Inquiry	3.02	2.89
38	M	Talent Unlimited High School	3.00	2.68
39	Q	Academy of American Studies	2.95	2.91
40	Q	York Early College Academy	2.92	2.76
41	M	Benjamin Cardozo High School	2.91	2.90
42	Q	World Journalism School	2.90	2.55
43	Q	Science Technology and Research Early High School	2.88	2.78
44	M	High School for Construction Trades, engineering and Architecture	2.87	2.91
45	Q	Forest Hills High School	2.87	2.80
46	Q	Frank McCourt	2.87	2.61
47	Q	Thomas Edison	2.86	2.88

48	SI	CSI High School for International Studies	2.86	2.68
49	Q	Young Women's Leadership School	2.85	2.78
50	K	Young Women's Leadership School	2.85	2.78
51	Q	Maspeth High School	2.82	2.73
52	SI	Tottenville High School	2.82	2.68
53	Q	All City Leadership Secondary School	2.81	2.61
54	Q	High School for Public Service	2.81	2.67
55	M	City College Academy of Arts	2.80	2.87
56	Q	Repertory Company High School for Theatre Arts	2.80	2.50
57	Q	Bedford Academy High School	2.79	2.67
58	K	Aviation Career and Technical High School	2.78	2.92

Source and Notes: There are 58 high schools in the chart. Eight are SHSAT exam schools and 50 are screened high schools. The source is the New York City Department of Education School Quality Guide 2013-14. Page 17 Peer Group Schools. "Each school's performance is compared to the performance of schools in its peer group. Peer schools are those New York City public schools with a student population most like this school's population, according to the peering characteristics. Each school has up to 40 peer schools (except for K-8 schools, which have up to 30 peer schools). Peer groupings are created using a matching methodology that examines the mathematical difference between a school and all potential peers on the peering characteristics. Schools with the smallest difference across all the characteristics are peered together."

Appendix 3:

Screened high schools with selective admissions policy by Borough

While the focus of this Discussion Paper are the screened high schools, there is actually a wide variation in entrance test scores for these schools, even though they may have the same admissions policy (a 3 or 4 test score, 85 GPA or higher for English, Math, Science and Social Studies, good attendance). For instance, even though the Bronx has seven screened schools requiring a 3 or 4, none of these schools are in the top 50 high schools based on 8th grade ELA and Math test scores. One school, Bronx Center for Science and Mathematics, comes very close. This directory was prepared to help parents navigate the high school admissions system.

Bronx High Schools with Screened Programs

High School	Screened Criteria: Test Scores/Grades	9th Grade Screened Openings	Geographic Eligibility/Priority	Screened Program Area	Top Ranked Screened High schools
1. Bronx High School for Medical Sciences	3 or 4, 75 or higher	81	Priority to continuing students/then to Bronx	Health Professions	No
2. Bronx Center for Science and Mathematics	Limited screened	108	Priority to Bronx students	Science and math	no
3. Cinema School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	81	Open to all NYC residents	Film/video	No
4. Dewitt Clinton	3 or 4, 80 or higher	120	Priority to Bronx students	Macy Honors Communities Program	No
5. Herbert Lehman	3 or 4, 85 or higher	60	Only Bronx students	Ann Hutchinson Academy Engineering	No
6. In-Tech Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher	136	Priority to continuing 8th graders, Then to District 10 students or residents, Then to Bronx students or residents	Computer Science and Technology	No
7. Marble High School for International Studies	Writing sample	54	Priority to Bronx students or residents		No
8. Riverdale Kingsbridge Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher	160	Open only to Bronx students or residents, Priority to continuing 8th graders, Then to students residing in the geographical catchment area	Humanities	No
9. Westchester Square Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher	54	Priority to Bronx students or residents who attend an information session, Then to New York City residents who attend an information session, then to Bronx students or residents.	Honors Program	No
TOTAL		854			

Manhattan High Schools with Screened Programs

High School	Screened Criteria: Test Scores/Grades	9th Grade Screened Openings	Geographic Eligibility/Priority	Screened Program Area(s)	Top Ranked Screened High schools
1. A Philip Randolph Campus High School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	342	NYC	Humanities, Engineering and Health Professions	No
2. Bard High School Early College	3 or 4, 85 or higher, entrance exam	150	NYC		Yes
3. Baruch College Campus High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	111	Priority to District 2 and then Manhattan	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	yes
4. Beacon	3 or 4, 85 or higher	310	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
5. Columbia Secondary	3 or 4, 90 or higher	96	Priority to continuing students, then NYC	Science and Math	Yes
6. Eleanor Roosevelt	3 or 4, 90 or higher	125	Priority to District 2 and then Manhattan	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
7. Frederick Douglas Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher in Science/ Math; 85 or higher in Social Studies/English	160	Priority to continuing students, then Districts, 3, 4 or 5	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	No
	3 or 4, 85 or higher in Science/ Math; 80 or higher in Social Studies/English	160	Priority to continuing students, then Districts, 3, 4 or 5	Science and Math;	no
8. Gramercy Arts High School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	32	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary; International Baccalaureate Program	No
9. High School for Environmental Studies	3 or 4, 85 or higher	30	NYC	Environmental Science	No
10. High School for Health Professions and Human Services	3 or 4, 85 or higher	157	NYC	Health Professions	No
11. Hunter High School for Science		108	NYC	Science and math	Yes
12. Manhattan Center for Science and Mathematics	3 or 4, 85 or higher	412	Priority to students attending Isaac Newton Middle School for Math & Science; then to District 4 students or residents	Science and Math	Yes
13. Millennium High School	3 or 4, 90 or higher	180	Priority to students who live or attend school south of East Houston or West Houston Street; then to Manhattan students or residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
14. New Explorations in Science, Technology and Math	3 or 4, 85 or higher	160	Priority to continuing 8th graders; Then to New York City residents	Science and Math	Yes
15. NYC I School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	118	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes

16.	NYC Lab School for Collaborative Studies	3 or 4, 85 or higher	136	Priority to District 2 students or residents; then to Manhattan students or residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
17.	NYC Museum School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	124	Priority to District 2 students or residents; Then to New York City residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
18.	Professional Performing Arts	audition	102	Priority to continuing 8 th graders	Performing arts	yes
19.	School of the Future	3 or 4, 85 or higher	108	Priority to continuing 8th graders; then to District 2 students or residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
20.	Special Music School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	50	Priority to continuing 8 th graders	music	yes
21.	Talent Unlimited	audition	142	New York City	Performing arts	yes
Total			3313			

Brooklyn High Schools with Screened Programs

High School	Screened Criteria: Test Scores/Grades	9th Grade Screened Openings	Geographic Eligibility/Priority	Screened Program Area(s)	Top Ranked Screened High Schools
1. Abraham Lincoln	3 or 4, 85 or higher	184	Brooklyn	Science and Math; Humanities & Interdisciplinary	NA
2. Benjamin Banneker Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher	240	Priority to Districts 13, 14, 15 and 16 students or residents	Humanities; Communications; Engineering; Health	Yes
3. Boys and Girls High	3 or 4, 80 or higher	350	Brooklyn	Science and Math; Computer Science and Technology	No
4. Brooklyn College Academy	3 or 4, 80 or higher	140	Priority to continuing 8th graders; all Brooklyn		No
5. Brooklyn Millennium	3 or 4, 85 or higher	135	Brooklyn	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	yes
6. Clara Barton	3 or 4, 85 or higher	100	NYC	Science and Math	NO
7. Fort Hamilton	3 or 4, 90 or higher	140	Brooklyn	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
8. High School for Enterprise, Business and Technology	3 or 4, 85 or higher	60	NYC	Science and Math	No
9. James Madison	3 or 4, 85 or higher	202	Brooklyn	Computer Science and Technology; Law and Government	yes

10. John Dewey	3 or 4, 85 or higher	68	Brooklyn	Computer Science and Technology	No
11. Leon Goldstein	2 to 4 80 (ELA and Social Studies) and 85 or higher (math and science)	275	NYC	Science and Math	yes
12. Medgar Evers	3 or 4, 80 or higher	233	Priority to continuing 8th Graders; then NYC	Science and Math; Computer Technology	Yes
13. Midwood	3 or 4, 90 or higher	550	NYC	Medical Science; Humanities	Yes
14. New Utrecht High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	40	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	-
15. Science Skills Center High School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	170	NYC	Science and Math; Engineering; Humanities	No
Total		2887			

Queens High Schools with Screened Programs

High School	Screened Criteria: Test Scores/Grades	9th Grade Screened Openings	Geographic Eligibility/Priority	Screened Program Area(s)	Top Ranked Screened High Schools
1. Academy of American Studies	3 or 4, 85 or higher	102	Priority to Queens students or residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
2. Aviation Career and Technical Education High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	106	NYC	Engineering	No
3. Baccalaureate School for Global Education	3 or 4, 90 or higher	81	Priority to continuing 8th graders; Then to Queens students or residents	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
4. Bard Early College High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher; Entrance exam	160	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
5. Bayside High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	200	Queens	Humanities and Interdisciplinary; Environmental Science	-
6. Benjamin Cardozo High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	120	Queens	Science and Math	-
7. Forest Hills High School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	204	NYC	Science and Math	-
8. Francis Lewis High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	250	Queens	Science and Math, Humanities and Interdisciplinary	-
9. Frank Sinatra	audition	198	NYC	Arts	Yes
10. Hillcrest High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	102	NYC	Health Professions	-

11.	John Bowne High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	120	NYC	Science and Math	-
12.	Queens Vocational and Technical High School	3 or 4, 80 or higher	56	NYC	Computer Science and Technology	No
13.	Scholars Academy	3 or 4, 85 or higher	108	Priority to continuing 8th graders; then NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	yes
14.	Thomas Edison Career Technical Education	3 or 4, 85 or higher	50	NYC	Health Professions	-
		3 or 4, 80 or higher	28		Engineering	
15.	Townsend Harris High School	3 or 4, 90 or higher	270	NYC	Humanities and Interdisciplinary	Yes
16.	William Cullen Bryant High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	100	Queens	Math and Science	-
Total			2255			

Staten Island High Schools with Screened Programs

High School	Screened Criteria: Test Scores/Grades	9th Grade Screened Openings	Geographic Eligibility/Priority	Screened Program Area(s)	Top Ranked screened High Schools
1. New Dorp High School	3 or 4, 85 or higher	68	Priority to Staten Island residents	Science and math	-
2. Susan Wagner High School	3 or 4, 90 or higher	114	Priority to Staten Island residents	humanities	-
	3 or 4, 80 or higher	27		Law and government	-
	3 or 4, 80 or higher	34		Business	-
3. Tottenville High School	3 or 4, 90 or higher	68	Priority to Staten Island residents	Humanities,	-
		68		Science and math	
Total		379			

Source and notes: New York City-Department of Education High School Directories 2014-15

<http://schools.nyc.gov/ChoicesEnrollment/High/Resources/default.htm>. The ten hybrid high school programs are specified as a yes or no in the last column. The reason is because the NYS ELA and Math scores are not broken down by admission into individual school program. The data is only available for the entire school.

C. Sources and References:

1. Citywide Council on High Schools NYC Department of Education Annual Report 2012-13, 2013-2014
2. High School Choice in New York City: A Report on the School Choices and Placements of Low-Achieving Students. April, 2013. Lori Nathanson, Sean Corcoran, Christine Baker-Smith. The Research Alliance for New York City Schools and Institute for Education and Social Policy, New York University
3. www.insideschools.org: The Inside Schools website is an invaluable resource. The website was used to double check information on the screened schools.
4. In defense of New York City's selective high schools by Derrell Bradford. Feb. 2, 2015. Thomas Fordham Institute. <http://edexcellence.net/articles/in-defense-of-new-york-citys-selective-high-schools>
5. Is Demography Destiny? Neighborhood Demographics and Public High School Students Readiness for College in New York City. Norm Fruchter, Megan Hester, Christina Mokhtar and Zach Shahn. Annenberg Institute for School Reform at Brown University. 2012
6. New York City-Department of Education High School Directories 2014-15
<http://schools.nyc.gov/ChoicesEnrollment/High/Resources/default.htm>
7. New York City Department of Education. Round 2 Guide. 2015 <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/0F71D1AA-FBBE-4DD3-8DB2-91B7EB1B03F5/0/Round2ProgramListandGuide.pdf>
8. New York City Department of Education School Quality Guides 2013-14. Individual School Quality Guides were used to verify information about the high schools discussed in this paper.
9. New York City Department of Education. New York State 2013 Math and ELA Seventh Grade Test scores
<http://schools.nyc.gov/Accountability/data/TestResults/ELAandMathTestResults>
10. New York City's Best Public High Schools. Hemphill, Clara. Teachers College Press. 2007
11. New York City Independent Budget Office. New York City Public School Indicators. Demographics, Resources, Outcomes. May 2013.
12. Pathways to an Elite Education: Application, Admission, and Matriculation to New York City's Specialized High Schools Working Paper. By Sean P. Corcoran (IESP) and Christine Baker-Smith. The Research Alliance for New York City Schools at New York University. March 2015.

Minor revisions were made to this report in 2018.